



MICHAEL P. BELL
MAYOR

October 22, 2012

To: The Honorable President Joe McNamara and Members of City Council

From: Michael P. Bell, Mayor

Subject: **Executive Exempt Salary Increases**

At the suggestion of several members of Council over the course of recent hearings, I have implemented salary adjustments within the ranks of the City's Executive Exempt staff. The affected group of employees includes Deputy Mayors, Directors, Commissioners, Managers, and Attorneys, including our Municipal Court Prosecutors. Most of these employees were with the City well before I became Mayor. These increases have been granted within the existing salary ranges. I regret the fact that some deserving employees cannot have their salaries raised, as they are already at the maximum of the pay ranges that have been in effect since 1998, a period of fourteen years.

Council could have chosen to follow my lead to comprehensively update Executive Exempt pay ranges, especially in light of the report that was submitted to Council that clearly indicated that our pay scales are not competitive with comparable major cities and suburban jurisdictions. Instead, Council has chosen to ignore, through inaction, the fact that it has been fourteen years since Executive Exempt pay ranges have been increased, and decided to put politics, and union pressure, ahead of the need to properly compensate the management team that led our city from the "fiscal cliff" of a \$48 million deficit in 2010 to a balanced budget at the end of 2011.

Please find attached a document summarizing the salary increases I have authorized. These raises total approximately \$295,000 and became effective on October 19, 2012. I am certain that some members of Council will criticize these raises, as the comments of some members make it evident that they do not value the work performed daily by Toledo's executive leadership team.

Council members engaging in such criticism should be cognizant of, but choose to ignore, the fact that these salary increases pale in comparison to the dollar value of pay and benefit increases granted by Council to our non-Executive Exempt employees since 1998 (fourteen years). Please refer to the answer to Council Referral 253-12 which is attached to document this inequity. The salary study report submitted by the Administration clearly indicates the fact that, through years of inaction, Toledo is no longer competitive with comparable jurisdictions in the overall compensation of its senior leadership.

The Honorable President Joe McNamara and Members of City Council
October 22, 2012
Page 2

An example of the inequity between bargaining unit employees and Executive Exempt staff is the fact that, year to date in 2012, nearly \$6.2 million in non-base wage payments have been paid to other City employees as outlined on the attached document. Step increases in contracts, based solely on years of service, approach \$1 million to date in 2012.

Another concern about the lack of Council's inaction on Executive Exempt salary ranges is succession planning and recruitment of executive staff. Would you accept a promotion knowing you would receive less pay than your subordinates? That is exactly the situation Council has created in certain cases by refusing to increase Executive Exempt pay scales.

The labor agreements approved by Council for the period from 2009 (before I took office) through 2012 have also provided generous pay increases to our unionized employees, even though they have given concessions in the areas of pension pickup and health care contributions. The last page of this memorandum outlines the dollar value and percentage pay increases for unionized supervisory employees from 2010 through 2014.

Finally, I recognize and value the daily contributions to our City's operations of four Executive Exempt employees whose salaries are set by City Council according to our Charter. These employees are Clerk of Council Jerry Dendinger, Assistant Clerk Julie Gibbons, Auditor Scott Wheelock, and Plan Commission Director Tom Lemon. If it were in my power, I would grant these deserving long-term employees raises in line with the increases I have authorized for those employees in my Administration's leadership ranks.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Michael P. Bell', with a stylized, elongated flourish extending to the right.

Michael P. Bell
Mayor

Attachments

Executive Exempt Salary Increases
October 22, 2012

Name	Department/Division	Salary	Salary Revised
Deputy Mayors			
Green, Shirley L	Deputy Mayor	\$90,002	\$92,500
Herwat, Stephen J	Deputy Mayor	\$90,002	\$92,500
Syring, Paul F	Acting Deputy Mayor	\$85,001	\$92,500
Directors			
Grachek, Ellen M	Human Resources	\$85,001	\$92,000
Griffin, Perlean	Affirmative Action	\$80,500	\$92,000
Loukx, Adam W	Law	\$89,001	\$92,000
McLean, Patrick A	Finance	\$90,000	\$92,000
Moore, Edward A	Public Service	\$88,005	\$92,000
Robertson, Valerie L	ICT	\$76,500	\$92,000
Santiago, Lourdes	Neighborhoods	\$84,999	\$92,000
Welch, David E	Public Utilities	\$88,001	\$92,000
Zervos, Chris J	Inspection	\$77,501	\$92,000
Commissioners			
Murphy, Timothy D	Environmental Services	\$72,500	\$77,500
Pratt, David E	Streets, Bridges and Harbor	\$71,999	\$77,500
Highsmith, Julian E	Facilities and Fleet	\$73,998	\$77,500
Benner, Bryan J	Commissioner - Finance	\$75,000	\$77,500
Garvin, Dennis	Parks, Recreation and Forestry	\$75,001	\$77,500
Whitney, Robin L	Utilities Administration	\$75,001	\$77,500
Kovacs, Kathleen	Neighborhoods	\$69,499	\$77,000
Campbell, Melanie	Budget	\$65,000	\$75,000
McArthur, Paul	Accounts	\$70,500	\$75,000
Wood, Amy	Special Projects	\$70,000	\$74,000
Managers			
Burkhardt, Veronica	Neighborhoods	\$68,001	\$68,500
Ball, E J	ICT	\$65,000	\$66,000
Plath, Tim	Street, Bridges and Harbor	\$62,000	\$65,000
Sorgenfrei, Jennifer A	Public Information Officer	\$60,000	\$65,000
Harris, Diane R	Payroll	\$58,132	\$65,000
Ringlein, Paul T	Code Enforcement	\$62,481	\$63,500
Kennedy, Dennis H	Code Enforcement	\$60,008	\$63,500
Davenport, Denise	Utilities - Call City Hall	\$59,001	\$63,000
Dahar, Agnes	Economic Development	\$60,000	\$62,000
Gogol, Jennifer L	Utilities Administration	\$54,999	\$60,000
Stewart, William	Mayor's Office	\$54,999	\$60,000
Bannister, Alan	Affirmative Action	\$54,995	\$60,000
Bombrys, Michael R	NBA	\$48,499	\$56,000
Mikolajczyk, Jeremy A	Street, Bridges and Harbor	\$52,790	\$54,000

Executive Exempt Salary Increases
October 22, 2012

Name	Department/Division	Salary	Salary Revised
Executive Directors			
Alvarado, Linda	Brd Comm Relations	\$54,999	\$60,000
Contreras-Harris, Rosalinda	Youth Commission	\$50,001	\$54,000
Law Department Employees			
Toska, David	Chief-Legal Section	\$67,995	\$80,000
Charles, Jeffrey B	Chief-Legal Section	\$74,000	\$80,000
Kovacik, Leslie	Acting General Counsel	\$77,500	\$80,000
Niedzielski, Michael J	Chief-Legal Section	\$67,246	\$70,600
Bibish IV, John E	Chief-Legal Section	\$57,491	\$60,000
Green III, Merritt W	Sr. Attorney	\$70,000	\$75,500
Granata, Eileen M	Sr. Attorney	\$65,000	\$70,000
Madigan, John T	Sr. Attorney	\$65,000	\$68,000
Colturi, Jeffrey S	Sr. Attorney	\$62,504	\$67,000
Quintero, Arturo M	Sr. Attorney	\$62,504	\$67,000
Anagnos, Joyce	Sr. Attorney	\$57,990	\$63,000
Billmaier, Pamela	Sr. Attorney	\$49,816	\$53,000
Smith, Victoria	Attorney	\$43,992	\$52,000
Galch, Sharon D	Attorney	\$41,995	\$52,000
Turvey-Albert, Michelle	Attorney	\$39,499	\$50,000
Kunzler, John S	Attorney	\$39,499	\$50,000
Jones, Jimmie L	Attorney	\$39,000	\$50,000



OFFICE OF THE MAYOR

Date: August 30, 2012

To: The Honorable Joe McNamara and Members of City Council

From: Stephen J. Herwat, Deputy Mayor – Operations

Subject: **Council Referral 253-12**

Referral

Requesting a comparison related to changes in TMC Chapter 2101, how pay increases compare to the labor agreements negotiated with the City, ex. Police, Fire, AFSCME. Provide any increases in these positions' pay since 1998.

Response

Please find attached a matrix containing the changes in base wage increases and the history of pension pickup changes for the City's Public Safety units, Local 7, Teamsters, Local 2058 and the Executive Exempt group since 1998.

Of note on the attached matrix are the following points:

For the period from 1998 to 2002:

- TPCOA members received a 15% increase in pay plus lump sum payments equalling 5%
- TPPA, Local 92 and Fire Chiefs' members received a 15% increase in pay
- Local 7 members received a 15.5% increase in pay and achieved full pension pickup in 1999
- Local 2058 members received a 16% increase in pay
- During this period Executive Exempt pay ranges were not increased since April of 1998

For the period from 2004 to 2008:

- TPCOA members received a 10.5% increase in pay, lump sum payments equalling 5%, and achieved full pension pickup in 2007
- TPPA, Local 92 and Fire Chiefs' members received a 10.5% increase in pay, a lump sum payment equalling 1%, and achieved full pension pickup in 2007
- Local 7 and Local 2058 members received a 10.5% increase in pay, and a lump sum payment equalling 1%
- During this period Executive Exempt pay ranges were not increased since April of 1998 and pension pickup was capped at 5% (the employee rate was 8.5% to 10%)

If you have any questions please do not hesitate to contact me.

Stephen J. Herwat,
Deputy Mayor – Operations

Attachment

Base Pay Wage Increase and Pension Pickup History - 1998 to 2014

08/26/12

			TPPA	TPCOA	Local 92	Fire Chiefs	Local 7	Teamsters	Local 2058	Executive Exempt (a)
1998	Base Pay	3%	1% lump + 3%	3%	3%	3%	3%	3%	4%	-
	Pension Pickup	2%	2%	1.50%	2%	1.50%	6.20%	3%	3%	3%
1999	Base Pay	3%	1% lump + 3%	3%	3%	3%	3.50%	3%	3%	0%
	Pension Pickup	3%	3%	3%	3%	3%	8.50%	4%	4%	4%
2000	Base Pay	2%	1% lump + 2%	2%	2%	2%	2%	2%	2%	0%
	Pension Pickup	4.50%	4.50%	4.50%	4.50%	4.50%	8.50%	4.50%	4.50%	5%
2001	Base Pay	3%	1% lump + 3%	3%	3%	3%	3%	3%	3%	0%
	Pension Pickup	4.75%	4.75%	4.75%	4.75%	4.75%	8.50%	5.25%	4.75%	4.75%
2002	Base Pay	4%	1% lump + 4%	4%	4%	4%	4%	4%	4%	0%
	Pension Pickup	5%	5%	5%	5%	5%	8.50%	6%	5%	5%
2003	Base Pay	0%	1% lump + 0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%
	Pension Pickup	5%	5%	5%	5%	5%	8.50%	6%	6%	5%
2004	Base Pay	2%	1% lump + 2%	2%	2%	2%	2%	0%	1% lump + 2%	0%
	Pension Pickup	5.50%	5.50%	5.50%	5.50%	5.50%	8.50%	6.50%	5.50%	5%
2005	Base Pay	1% lump + 2%	1% lump + 2%	1% lump + 2%	1% lump + 2%	1% lump + 2%	1% lump + 2%	1% lump + 2%	2%	0%
	Pension Pickup	6.25%	6.25%	6.25%	6.25%	6.25%	8.50%	7.25%	7.25%	5%
2006	Base Pay	1.50%	1% lump + 1.50%	1.50%	1.50%	1.50%	1.50%	0%	1.50%	0%
	Pension Pickup	6.25%	6.25%	6.25%	6.25%	6.25%	9%	8.00%	7.25%	5%
2007	Base Pay	2%	2% lump + 2%	2%	2%	2%	2%	1.5% + 1.5% lump	2%	0%
	Pension Pickup	8.50%	8.50%	8.50%	8.50%	8.50%	9.50%	8.50%	7.75%	5%
2008	Base Pay	3%	3%	3%	3%	3%	3%	2%	3%	0%
	Pension Pickup	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	8.50%	8.50%	5%
2009 (b)	Base Pay	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	3%	0%	0%
	Pension Pickup	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	8.50%	8.50%	5%
2010 (c)	Base Pay	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	1%	0%	0%
	Pension Pickup	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	7%	8.50%	5%
2011	Base Pay	3.50%	3.50%	3.5% (e)	3.5% (e)	3.5% (e)	2%	1%	2%	0%
	Pension Pickup	10%	10% (d)	10%	10%	10%	10%	5.50%	8.50%	5%
2012	Base Pay	\$1,500 lump (f)	\$1,200 lump (f)	\$1,250 lump (f)	\$1,500 lump (f)	\$1,500 lump (f)	0% + \$750 lump (f)	1%	0% + \$1,250 lump (f)	0%
	Pension Pickup	0%	5%	6%	5%	5%	7%	4.00%	5%	5%
2013	Base Pay	2.50%	2.5% + 2% spread	2%	\$1,500 lump + 2%	\$1,500 lump + 2%	0% + \$750 lump (f)	-	2%	-
	Pension Pickup	0%	2%	3%	3%	3%	3%	-	2%	-
2014	Base Pay	3%	3% + 3% spread	3.50%	3.5% + 3% spread	3.5% + 3% spread	reopener	-	2%	-
	Pension Pickup	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	3%	-	0%	-

(a) Executive Exempt Pay ranges have not been adjusted since April of 1998

(b) Does not include temporary reductions in 2009 pension pickup

(c) Does not include exigent circumstances temporary reductions in pension pickup in 2010

(d) Pension pickup restored to full 10% in May 2011

(e) Lieutenants and Captains in Local 92, and Battalion Chiefs and Deputy Chiefs in the TFCA not only received a 3.5% pay increase, but also received an additional increase in pay based on the 3% increase in spread between a Lieutenant and a Firefighter (from 16% to 19%) in December of 2011

(f) For employees subject to the reduction in pension pickup

City of Toledo
Non-Base Wage Payments - 2012 to Date

CEP	Career Enhancement Police	\$1,118,799.38
CMP	Comp time payout	\$1,213.20
CMS	Comp time payout Police and Fire	\$578,960.02
DEV	Professional Development	\$139,788.00
FCM	Fire Clothing Maintenance	\$252,080.00
FCS	Acting Overtime	\$504.51
FPF	Add on Pay based on education Police	\$8,955.23
FSP	Overtime Shift Pay Patrolman	\$7,395.95
FSR	Overtime Saturday	\$4,351.59
LSM	Lump Sum Payment	\$1,846,987.50
MSC	Miscellaneous Pay	\$62.50
PCC	Police Command Clothing	\$77,050.00
PF	Pension Fire	\$68,192.18
PFC	Pension Fire Chief	\$3,726.09
PFT	Police Fire Stipend	\$446,000.00
PLC	Police Clothing	\$68,726.65
PP	Pension Police	\$66,328.09
PPC	Pension Police Command	\$50,601.96
SHL	Police Fire Holiday	\$1,113,884.88
STP	Stress Pay	\$68,041.67
STR	Stress Pay	\$234,575.14
TOL	Tool	\$36,300.00
	Total	\$6,192,524.54

Increase in Bargaining Unit Base Wages – 2010 to 2014
Based on Contracts Approved by Council from 2009-2012

Position	Percent Increase in Base Wage – 2010 to 2014	Amount of Base Wage Increase 2010 to 2014
Fire Deputy Chief	15.07%	\$14,489
Fire Battalion Chief	15.07%	\$12,823
Police Captain	13.82%	\$12,170
Fire Captain	12.09%	\$9,107
Police Lieutenant	13.83%	\$10,771
Fire Lieutenant	12.09%	\$7,918
Police Sergeant	13.82%	\$9,364
Local 2058 – Group 15	6.12%	\$4,811

Figures shown are based on the top of the pay range steps